

ALAC Rules of Procedure

Adjunct Document 03

At-Large Board Member Selection Implementation

This document is a historical review of the At-Large Board Member (ICANN Board Seat 15) selection process. Since the process is a relatively complex one which occurs only every three years, with potentially significant turnover in ALAC membership over the period, the ALAC Rules of Procedure call for the process to be carefully documented to ensure that the institutional memory is fully preserved.

The process used was created through extensive consultation throughout the At-Large community. Many alternative scenarios were considered, but ultimately the process that was decided upon had the support of the RALOs and the ALAC, and was ratified by the ICANN Board.

The resulting process along with the history and rationale for its selection was documented in a White Paper published in January 2010. The White paper can be found at <https://community.icann.org/display/ABMS/Director+White+Paper> (along with French and Spanish versions) and a PDF version at https://community.icann.org/download/attachments/2261726/ABS+White++Paper_FINAL_11012011_EN.pdf?version=1&modificationDate=1289613036000.

Based on community comment, some changes were made resulting in the process used in 2010. The overall process was enshrined in the ALAC Rules of Procedure (RoP). When the RoP were re-written in 2013, there were several operational details changed, but the core process remained the one used in 2010. Although there were discussions initiated to alter the overall methodology that did not materialize.

The formal creation and documentation of the overall process was carried out by the At-Large Board Selection Design Team (ABSdt). The actual selection process was overseen by the Board Selection Process Committee (BSPC) and the slate of candidates was selected by the Board Candidate Evaluation Committee (BCEC). In 2010, the ABSdt was given the responsibility of carrying out the role of the BSPC. In the 2013 RoP the BSPC was renamed the Board Member Selection Process Committee (BMSPC).

Documents for the 2010 Selection

ABSdt History: <https://community.icann.org/display/ABMS/At-Large+Board+Selection+Design+Team+2010>.

BCEC Operating Principles:

<https://community.icann.org/display/ABMS/Draft+BCEC+Operating+Principles>. Note that although the word DRAFT was never removed, these were the final principles approved by the BCEC and used for the selection. The same applies to the Candidate Reference Form.

Criteria for Director: <https://community.icann.org/display/ABMS/Director%27s+Criteria>.

Call for Statement of Interest (renamed Expression of Interest in 2013):

<https://community.icann.org/download/attachments/2265195/Call%2520for%2520Statements%2520of%2520Interest%2520-%28SOIs%29%2520EN.doc>.

Statement of Interest (now Expression of Interest) form:

<https://community.icann.org/download/attachments/2265195/Online%2520Statement%2520of%2520Interest%2520-%2520EN.pdf?version=2&modificationDate=1288917841000>.

Form for Candidate References:

<https://community.icann.org/display/ABMS/Draft+Confidential+Applicant+Reference+Form>.

Details of the 2010 Process (including candidates):

<https://community.icann.org/display/ABMS/At-Large+Director+Candidate+2010+Workspace>.

Report of the ABSdt/BSPC and BCEC:

<https://community.icann.org/display/ABMS/ABSdt+and+BCEC+Post-Mortem+Report>.

Timeline for the 2010 Process

Milestone	Date
BCEC Publication of Call for Sols	Wed 21-Jul-2010
Original Deadline for submission of Sols	Sat 21-Aug-2010
Extended Deadline for submission of Sols	Mon 06-Sep-2010
BCEC announcement of applicant demographics	Thu 09-Sep-2010
BCEC announcement of slate of candidates	Thu 28-Oct-2010
Petition Period Ends, Final slate known	Sun 07-Nov-2010
Start of 1st round vote	Mon 22-Nov-2010
End of 1st round vote	Thu 25-Nov-2010
Start of 2nd round vote	Fri 26-Nov-2010
End of 2nd round vote, announcement of winner	Sun 28-Nov-2010

Changes RoP Seat 15 Selection Process

When the ALAC RoP were re-written and adopted in 2013, several changes were made to the Director selection process based on problems encountered during the 2010 selection or addressing possible conflict situations.

- Prohibition on a BMSPC member submitting an Expression of Interest.
- Prohibition on candidates being members of the electorate.
- Provision to replace, for the purposes of the Board Member selection vote:
 - members of the electorate who are candidates; or
 - ALAC seats that are currently unoccupied.
- Require that if RALO Chair's vote is to be directed by the region's ALSs, that this decision and how the vote is to be cast must be taken by a formal vote of the RALO.
- Prohibition of ALAC Member (or those chosen to replace them) votes being directed by the RALO.

Issues Encountered During the 2010 Process

There were a number of problems encountered during the 2010 process that should be addressed by future BMSPCs and BCECs. Many of these are addressed on the report of the ABSdt/BSPC and BCEC referenced earlier, but the following highlights some of the more critical ones:

- Insufficient time for RALO petitions
- Insufficient time for RALO consultation prior to the vote (and particularly prior to the 2nd vote which was necessary in 2010).
- Lack of a backup means of voting in the case of technology failure.
- Transparency of the randomization process if one is necessary to eliminate ties.

Possible Timeline for the 2013/14 Process

According to the ICANN Bylaws, the final selection for the ICANN Board Seat 15 must be made no later than six months prior to the Director being seated at the conclusion of the ICANN Annual meeting. In 2014, that is scheduled to occur on 16 October. Therefore the Director must be selected no later than 16 April 2014.

Note that the voting part of the selection process must allow for at least three rounds of voting and optimally should allow for two additional rounds in the case of ties (to reduce the dependency on random selection). However, note that the voting periods need not be the typical ALAC vote of 5-7 days.

Following is an example of a schedule (not necessarily a good one!). There is a Scheduling Tool on the Wiki to help the BMSPC select a schedule which meets all of the Rules of Procedure criteria as well as provides ample time for the various parts of At-Large to play their part. The schedule will likely span two ICANN meetings and those must be factored in as well. The 2014 Scheduling tool can be found at <https://community.icann.org/display/ABMS/At-Large+Board+Member+2014+Selection>.

Milestone	Date
Start of selection of BMSPC and BCEC members	Tue 24-Sep-2013
ALAC Approval of the BMSPC	Tue 22-Oct-2013
ALAC Approval of the BCEC	Tue 22-Oct-2013
BMSCP Publication of final timeline	Tue 05-Nov-2013
BCEC Publication of Call for Eols	Tue 19-Nov-2013
Deadline for submission of Eols	Thu 19-Dec-2013
Request for Candidate References	Sat 21-Dec-2013
Deadline for submission of Candidate references	Sat 04-Jan-2014
BCEC announcement of slate of candidates	Sat 18-Jan-2014
Deadline for RALO identification of additional candidates	Sat 08-Feb-2014
Deadline for support from other RALOs for add'l candidates	Tue 18-Feb-2014
Publication of final slate	Thu 20-Feb-2014
Initiation of first round vote	Thu 13-Mar-2014
Announcement of winner	Sat 12-Apr-2014

For ALAC Approval – 2013-09-25